MIT 14.662 Spring 2018: Lecture 1 – An Overview of Topics and Questions

David Autor, MIT and NBER

February 7, 2018

Agenda

1 Incomes: Levels, Growth, Inequality

Household incomes Wage Inequality Intergenerational income mobility

2 Skills, Education, and Earnings Skills and educational attainment Wage differentials by skill Occupational change & employment polarization

- **3** Top Incomes and Superstars
- 4 Trade and Labor Markets
- **5** The Importance of Place
- 6 Minimum wages, Pay comparisons, Wage spillovers
- **7** Gender Differences in Education and Labor Markets

Falling World Poverty, 1981 - 2008

Data: Poverty rates in developing countries have fallen sharply since the early 1980s, although much of the decline reflects China's economic resurgence.



Source: OECD (2013), Perspectives on Global Development 2013, http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/888932812908.

Income Ginis in OECD: Mid 1980s Through Approximately 2013

Data: Income inequality has increased in most OECD countries since the mid-1980s.



Gini measure of income inequality, mid-1980s and 2013

Source: OECD (2015), In It Together: Why Less Inequality Benefits All, http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/888933207711.

Agenda

1 Incomes: Levels, Growth, Inequality Household incomes Wage Inequality

Intergenerational income mobility

2 Skills, Education, and Earnings Skills and educational attainment Wage differentials by skill Occupational change & employment polarization

- **3** Top Incomes and Superstars
- 4 Trade and Labor Markets
- **5** The Importance of Place
- 6 Minimum wages, Pay comparisons, Wage spillovers
- **7** Gender Differences in Education and Labor Markets

U.S. Real HH Incomes at Select Percentiles, 1967 - 2012



U.S. Census Bureau 2013

Growth in U.S. Real Mean Family Income by Quintile, 1947 – 1973 and 1973 – 2013



Source: U.S. Census Bureau, Historical Income Table F3 and Goldin and Katz (2007, Figure 1) for 1947-73

U.S. Census Bureau 2013

Average Annual Income % Change in Family Size-Adjusted Mean Income by Quintile



U.S. Census Bureau 2013

'Declining' U.S. 'Middle Class' 1971 – 2015

Share of adults living in middle-income households is falling

% of adults in each income tier



"Middle-income" households: Incomes that are two-thirds to double that of U.S. median household income (after adjusting for household size)

Pew Research Center 2015

$\Delta \text{Fraction}$ 'Upper Class' – $\Delta \text{Fraction}$ 'Lower Class" 1971 – 2015



Agenda

Incomes: Levels, Growth, Inequality Household incomes Wage Inequality Intergenerational income mobility Skills, Education, and Earnings

Skills and educational attainment Wage differentials by skill Occupational change & employment polarization

- **3** Top Incomes and Superstars
- 4 Trade and Labor Markets
- **5** The Importance of Place
- 6 Minimum wages, Pay comparisons, Wage spillovers
- **7** Gender Differences in Education and Labor Markets

Changes in the 90/10 Ratio of Full-Time Male Earnings Across Twelve OECD Countries, 1980-2011



Autor 2014

U.S. Earnings Inequality in the Post-War Era, 1945 - 2005



Goldin and Katz 2008

U.S. Indexed Real Incomes at the 20th, 50th and 95th Percentiles, 1945 – 2005



Goldin and Katz 2008

U.S. Real Weekly Wages (PCE Deflator) 1962 – 2012: Men



U.S. Real Weekly Wages (PCE Deflator) 1962 – 2012: Women



Growth in Log Real Weekly Wages 1970/72 - 2010/12



Average Hours Worked by Wage Percentile, 1970/2 and 2010/12: Men



Average Hours Worked by Wage Percentile, 1970/2 and 2010/12: Women



Evolution of Inequality in the UK, 1977 - 2006



Figure 8 Changes in earnings deciles in the United Kingdom 1977-2006

Atkinson 2008

Rise in West German Male Wage Inequality, 1985 - 2009



Note: figure shows percentiles of log real daily wage for full time male workers on their main job, deviated from value of same percentile in 1996 and multiplied by 100.

Card, Heining, Kline 2013

Agenda

1 Incomes: Levels, Growth, Inequality

Household incomes Wage Inequality Intergenerational income mobility

2 Skills, Education, and Earnings Skills and educational attainment Wage differentials by skill Occupational change & employment polarization

- **3** Top Incomes and Superstars
- 4 Trade and Labor Markets
- **5** The Importance of Place
- 6 Minimum wages, Pay comparisons, Wage spillovers
- **7** Gender Differences in Education and Labor Markets

Countries with High Cross-Sectional Inequality Have Low Relative Earnings Mobility



Fig. 5. Earnings inequality and economic mobility: Cross-national rela-

tionships. Reproduced from Corak [(44), figs. 1 and 4] with permission of the American Economic Association. In both panels, the mobility measure is equal to the intergenerational earnings "elasticity," meaning the average proportional increase in a son's adult earnings predicted by his father's adult earnings measured approximately three decades earlier. A higher intergenerational earnings elasticity threefore implies lower intergenerational

OECD Thinks so Too...

Inequality and mobility (intergenerational earnings elasticity) across OECD countries



Intergenerational earnings elasticity

Source: OECD (2015), In It Together: Why Less Inequality Benefits All, http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/888933207806.

Corak 2013

Comparing U.S. Parents' and Children's Income Distributions by Birth Cohort

B. Family Income Distributions: 1940 Birth Cohort

C. Family Income Distributions: 1980 Birth Cohort



Chetty et al. 2017

Absolute Mobility: Children Earning More than Their Parents



B. Mean Rate of Absolute Mobility by Cohort

Chetty et al. 2017

Absolute Mobility: Children Earning More than Their Parents



A. Selected Cohorts by Parent Income Percentile

Chetty et al. 2017

Counterfactuals for Absolute Mobility: Contributions of Slowing GDP growth vs. Rising Inequality



A. Counterfactual Rates of Absolute Mobility by Parent Income Percentile

Chetty et al. 2017

The Trend in Absolute Mobility is Extremely Highly Correlated with Trend in Intergenerational Income Growth

Mobility and child-parent income gap, linked over time

(Top) From online table 1, column CY, of Chetty *et al.* (see www.equality-of-opportunity.org/data/); (bottom) from table S1 in Chetty *et al.* (1). Based on authors' calculations (see SM).



Katz and Krueger 2017

Agenda

1 Incomes: Levels, Growth, Inequality

Household incomes Wage Inequality Intergenerational income mobility

2 Skills, Education, and Earnings Skills and educational attainment Wage differentials by skill Occupational change & employment polarization

- **3** Top Incomes and Superstars
- 4 Trade and Labor Markets
- **5** The Importance of Place
- 6 Minimum wages, Pay comparisons, Wage spillovers
- **7** Gender Differences in Education and Labor Markets

Agenda

1 Incomes: Levels, Growth, Inequality

Household incomes Wage Inequality Intergenerational income mobility

2 Skills, Education, and Earnings Skills and educational attainment Wage differentials by skill Occupational change & employment polarization

- **3** Top Incomes and Superstars
- 4 Trade and Labor Markets
- **5** The Importance of Place
- 6 Minimum wages, Pay comparisons, Wage spillovers
- Gender Differences in Education and Labor Markets

Wage Returns to Measured Skills Are Substantial but Variable Across Countries

Cross-national differences in wage returns to skills, 2011–2013

Percentage increase for a one standard deviation increase in skill



Hanushek et al. 2013

Measured Skills Highly Correlated with Education: Gaps in Literacy Proficiency by Education Group in OECD Countries



OECD Skills Outlook 2013

Emp Rates Uniformly High among Top Tercile PIAAC Scorers in 2012



Emp Rates Uniformly Low among Bottom Tercile PIAAC Scorers in 2012



Major Employment Transitions: Agriculture to Industry to Services


U.S. Educational Progression: Years of Completed Schooling by Birth Cohort, 1876 - 1975



Figure 1.4. Years of Schooling by Birth Cohorts, U.S. Native-Born: 1876 to 1975. Goldin and Katz, 2008

Years of Completed Schooling by Birth Cohort and Sex, 1876 - 1975



Figure 1.5. Years of Schooling by Birth Cohorts, U.S. Native-Born, by Sex: 1876 to 1975. This figure plots the mean years of completed schooling for U.S. native-born residents by birth cohort and sex, adjusted to age 35 using the approach described in the notes to Figure 1.4. Sources: 1940 to 2000 IPUMS.

U.S. High School Completion Rates by Birth Cohort 1930 – 1975





Source: Census IPUMS 1 percent samples for years 1960, 1970, 1980, 1990, and 2000. Sample includes adults ages 25 through 64 born after 1930 with nonmissing education. Plotted values correspond to predicted high school completion rates at age 35 by birth cohort. Predictions are obtained from an OLS regression of a high school completion dummy on sex by birth-year dummies and a quartic in age. Individuals are coded as high school graduates if they have completed twelve years of school (1960, 1970 and 1980 Census) or if they report a high school diploma or CED (1990 and 2000 Census).

Acemoglu and Autor 2012

U.S. College Completion Rates by Birth Cohort 1930 – 1975



Figure 8. College Completion Rates by Birth Cohort: 1930-1975

Acemoglu and Autor 2012

Distribution of Educational Attainment of the U.S. Workforce, 1915 – 2005: So Low in 1915!



1.8. Distribution of Educational Attainment of the Workforce: 1915 to Sources: See Table 1.2.

College Share of U.S. Hours Worked, 1963 - 2012



College Share of Hours Worked in the U.S. 1963 - 2012: Males and Females with ${<}10$ Years of Potential Experience



Tertiary Education Completion in OECD Countries as of 2012 by Age Groups, 25 - 34 and 55 - 65

% 25-34 year-olds 55-65 year-olds 70 60 50 \land 40 30 20 10 ÷ 0 Poland Ireland Finland Estonia Norway France Sweden Austria lapan Average spain Italy *(orea)* Denmark ingland/N. Ireland (UK) Cyprus¹ Flanders (Belgium) Australia Vetherlands Germany Canada **Jnited States** Czech Republic Slovak Republic

Population with tertiary education

Percentage, by age group

1. See notes at the end of this chapter.

Countries are ranked in descending order of the percentage of 25-34 year-olds with tertiary education. Source: Survey of Adult Skills (PIAAC) (2012), Table B2.2 in Annex B.

OFCD Skills Outlook 2013

Agenda

1 Incomes: Levels, Growth, Inequality

Household incomes Wage Inequality Intergenerational income mobility

2 Skills, Education, and Earnings Skills and educational attainment Wage differentials by skill Occupational change & employment polarization

- **3** Top Incomes and Superstars
- 4 Trade and Labor Markets
- **5** The Importance of Place
- **6** Minimum wages, Pay comparisons, Wage spillovers
- Gender Differences in Education and Labor Markets

Earnings Differentials between "College" and "High School" Young Adults 30 - 44 in OECD Countries, 2005

Country	Differential
Denmark	22%
Sweden	22%
Spain	30%
Australia	34%
Belgium	34%
Finland	38%
Italy	43%
Netherlands	47%
Austria	48%
France	48%
Korea	48%
Germany	50%
Ireland	59%
UK	61%

OECD (2007): Education at a Glance

Indexed Real Full-Time Wages in U.S. by Sex and Education, 1963-2012: Rising Return Reflects (in part) Falling HS Level



The U.S. College/High-School Premium, 1963 - 2012



Autor, 2014

Agenda

1 Incomes: Levels, Growth, Inequality

Household incomes Wage Inequality Intergenerational income mobility

2 Skills, Education, and Earnings
 Skills and educational attainment
 Wage differentials by skill
 Occupational change & employment polarization

- **3** Top Incomes and Superstars
- 4 Trade and Labor Markets
- **5** The Importance of Place
- 6 Minimum wages, Pay comparisons, Wage spillovers
- Gender Differences in Education and Labor Markets

Average Change per Decade in US Occupational Employment Shares for Two Periods: 1940–1980 and 1980–2010



Katz & Margo, 2014 (in Autor 2015)

Occupational Polarization, 1979 – 2012Percent Growth in Employment by Occupational Category



Occupational Polarization in the U.S., 1982 – 2012: An Aggregate View



Notes: Data from the Bureau of Labor Statistics, Current Population Survey. See Appendix A for details.

Employment Polarization in the European Union, 1993 - 2010



Occupational Polarization, 1979 - 1989, 1990-2007



Figure 5. Smoothed Changes in Employment by Occupational Skill Percentile, 1979-2007

Acemoglu and Autor 2011

Occupational Polarization, 1979 – 2007, Detailed View



Acemoglu and Autor 2011

Evolution of Employment in Occupational Groups by Skills Proficiency, 1998 – 2009 (24 OECD Countries)

Evolution of employment in occupational groups defined by level of skills proficiency

Percentage change in the share of employment relative to 1998, by occupational groups defined by workers' average level of proficiency in literacy and numeracy



OECD Skills Outlook 2013

Growth of High-Math/High-Social Occupations 1980 - 2012



Occupational Skill and Wage Profiles of U.S. College Workers by Year of Labor Market Entry, 1990 - 2010

Declining Fortunes of Young College Workers Since 2000?



FIGURE 1. COGNITIVE EMPLOYMENT AND WAGE PROFILES FOR EXACTLY COLLEGE WORKERS

Beaudry, Green and Sand 2014

Occupational Skill and Wage Profiles of U.S. Post-College Workers by Year of Labor Market Entry, 1990 - 2010



Declining Fortunes of Young Post-College Workers Since 2000?



Beaudry, Green and Sand 2014

Agenda

1 Incomes: Levels, Growth, Inequality

Household incomes Wage Inequality Intergenerational income mobility

2 Skills, Education, and Earnings Skills and educational attainment Wage differentials by skill Occupational change & employment polarization

3 Top Incomes and Superstars

- 4 Trade and Labor Markets
- **5** The Importance of Place
- 6 Minimum wages, Pay comparisons, Wage spillovers
- Gender Differences in Education and Labor Markets

OECD Top 1% Income Shares, 1981 - 2012

Data: Top earners have increased their share of total earnings in most OECD countries since the 1980s.

Share of top 1% incomes in total pre-tax income, 1981-2012 (or latest year available)



Source: OECD (2014), "Focus on Top Incomes and Taxation in OECD Countries: Was the crisis a game changer?", http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/888932965953.

OECD Income Taxes Becoming Less Progressive

Data: Tax rates on top incomes fell substantially between the 1980s and the financial crisis.

Maximum, minimum and average statutory tax rates on top incomes in OECD countries, 1981-2013 (or latest)



Source: OECD (2014), "Focus on Top Incomes and Taxation in OECD Countries: Was the crisis a game changer?", http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/888932965953.

Top Decile Income U.S. Income Share, 1917 – 2015



Top Decile Wage Share, 1917 – 2015



Top Decile U.S. Income Shares, 1917 – 2015: P1, P1-P5, P5-P10



Top Decile U.S. Wage Income Shares, 1917 – 2015: P1, P1-P5, P5-P10



Average Real Wage Incomes: Top 1% and Bottom 99%



Piketty and Saez, 2003 (updated to 2015)

Top 0.1% Income Share, 1917 – 2015



Piketty and Saez. 2003 (updated to 2015)

Source: Piketty and Saez, 2003 updated to 2015. Series based on pre-tax cash market income including or excluding realized capital gains, and always excluding government transfers.

Top 0.1% Income Share, 1917 – 2015: Income Sources



US Top 0.1% Pre-Tax Income Share and Composition

Source: Piketty and Saez, 2003 updated to 2015. Series based on pre-tax cash market income including or excluding realized capital gains, and always excluding government transfers.

Top 1% Income Share: Anglophone Countries



Figure 8. Top 1 Percent Share: English Speaking Countries (U-shaped), 1910–2005

Atkinson, Piketty, Saez 2011

Top 1% Income Share: Middle Europe and Japan



Figure 9. Top 1 Percent Share: Middle Europe and Japan (L-shaped), 1900-2005

Atkinson, Piketty, Saez 2011

Top 1% Income Share: Nordic Countries and Southern Europe



Figure 10. Top 1 Percent Share: Nordic and Southern Europe (U/L-shaped), 1900-2006

Atkinson, Piketty, Saez 2011
Top 1% Income Share: Developing Countries



Figure 11. Top 1 Percent Share: Developing Countries, 1920-2005

Adding Capital Gains: US, Canada, Spain, Sweden and Finland



Figure 7. Effect of Capital Gains on Share of Top Percentile, 1949-2006

Atkinson, Piketty, Saez 2011

Occupations and National Income Shares of Top 1 Percent of Households, 1979 – 2005



Bakija, Cole and Heim 2012

Occupations of the Top 1 Percent of U.S. Households, 1979 – 2005



Bakija, Cole and Heim 2012

Median Earnings Gap Between College & High School Grads Roughly Doubles between 1979 and 2012

College/high school median annual earnings gap, 1979–2012



In constant 2012 dollars

Autor, 2014

Agenda

1 Incomes: Levels, Growth, Inequality

Household incomes Wage Inequality Intergenerational income mobility

2 Skills, Education, and Earnings Skills and educational attainment Wage differentials by skill Occupational change & employment polarization

- **3** Top Incomes and Superstars
- 4 Trade and Labor Markets
- **5** The Importance of Place
- 6 Minimum wages, Pay comparisons, Wage spillovers
- **7** Gender Differences in Education and Labor Markets

Small Economies Trade More as Share of GDP



International imports and exports in goods and services

Merchandise Trade to GDP 1960 – 2009: Rising



Rise of Middle-Income Countries in World Trade

	Trade partner	Exports to partner relative to regional GDP			Imports from partner relative to regional GDP		
Region		1994	2008	Percentage point change	1994	2008	Percentage point change
Low-income countries	Low-income countries	0.8%	3.2%	2.4	0.8%	3.2%	2.4
	Middle-income countries	4.5%	11.6%	7.1	6.0%	17.1%	11.1
	China, India	1.1%	8.3%	7.2	1.8%	10.7%	8.9
	High-income countries	20.0%	31.8%	11.8	15.1%	23.0%	7.9
	World	26.3%	55.0%	28.6	23.7%	54.0%	30.4
Mid-income countries	Low-income countries	0.7%	2.1%	1.4	0.5%	1.4%	0.9
	Middle-income countries	5.3%	15.6%	10.3	5.3%	15.6%	10.3
	China, India	2.2%	7.5%	5.3	2.4%	7.4%	5.0
	High-income countries	16.9%	29.6%	12.7	18.6%	26.0%	7.4
	World	25.1%	54.8%	29.8	26.8%	50.4%	23.6
China and India	Low-income countries	0.8%	2.7%	1.9	0.5%	2.1%	1.6
	Middle-income countries	9.5%	15.2%	5.7	8.6%	15.4%	6.8
	China, India	0.1%	1.2%	1.1	0.1%	1.2%	1.1
	High-income countries	14.3%	25.3%	11.0	9.8%	14.1%	4.3
	World	24.8%	44.4%	19.6	19.0%	32.7%	13.7
High-income countries	Low-income countries	0.3%	0.7%	0.4	0.5%	1.0%	0.5
	Middle-income countries	3.7%	6.6%	2.9	3.4%	7.5%	4.1
	China, India	0.5%	1.7%	1.2	0.7%	3.1%	2.4
	High-income countries	12.8%	16.9%	4.1	12.8%	16.9%	4.1
	World	17.4%	26.0%	8.6	17.4%	28.6%	11.2

Exports and Imports Relative to GDP by Regional Trading Partner

Hanson 2012

China's Historic Rise as a World Manufacturing Power



Autor, Dorn, Hanson 2016

The Share of U.S. Employment in Manufacturing, 1939 – 2014



U.S. Manufacturing Employment Fell by 20% During 1999-2007, and by 32% During 1999-2016



U.S. Manufacturing Employment, 1939 - 2016 (1,000s)

Unequal Gains: Parts of America Most Affected by China's Rising Manufacturing Prowess, 1990 – 2007

Most-affected areas of the U.S.

Colors show which areas were most affected by China's rise, based on the increase in Chinese imports per worker in each area from 1990 to 2007. Hovering over each area on the map will show a demographic breakdown of that area, below, and its most-affected industries, at right.

Mod-affected 20% Second-highest 20% Middle 20% Second-lowest 20% Least-affected 20%

Most-affected industries



Autor, Dorn, Hanson & Wall Street Journal, 2016

Regional Tariff Changes in Brazil 1990 - 1995





Agenda

1 Incomes: Levels, Growth, Inequality Household incomes

Wage Inequality Intergenerational income mobility

2 Skills, Education, and Earnings Skills and educational attainment Wage differentials by skill Occupational change & employment polarization

- **3** Top Incomes and Superstars
- 4 Trade and Labor Markets

5 The Importance of Place

6 Minimum wages, Pay comparisons, Wage spillovers

7 Gender Differences in Education and Labor Markets

The Geography of Upward Mobility in America

> 16.8% 12.9% - 16.8% 11.3% - 12.9% 9.9% - 11.3% 9.0% - 9.9% 8.1% - 9.0% 7.1% - 8.1% 6.1% - 7.1% 4.8% - 6.1% < 4.8% Missing Data

Children's Chances of Reaching Top 20% of Income Distribution Given Parents in Bottom 20%

Chetty and Hendren, 2014

Children's Predicted Income Rank at Age 26 by Parents Income Percentile



C. For Children with Parent at the 25th Percentile (County)



D. For Children with Parent at the 75th Percentile (County)

Chetty and Hendren 2018

'Causal Effects' of Place on Children of 25th Pctile HH's





Chetty and Hendren 2018

Agenda

1 Incomes: Levels, Growth, Inequality Household incomes

Wage Inequality Intergenerational income mobility

2 Skills, Education, and Earnings Skills and educational attainment Wage differentials by skill Occupational change & employment polarization

- **3** Top Incomes and Superstars
- 4 Trade and Labor Markets
- **5** The Importance of Place

6 Minimum wages, Pay comparisons, Wage spillovers

7 Gender Differences in Education and Labor Markets

Minimum Wage Increases Between 1979 and 2016



Notes: The figure shows all MW increases between 1979 and 2016. There are at total of 516 minimum wage increases. The blue circles show the primary minimum wage events used in estimating equation 4; the partially transparent orange triangles highlight small minimum wage changes where minimum wage increased less than \$0.25\$ (the size of our wage bins) or where less than 2 percent of the workforce earned between the new and the old minimum wage. The green circles indicate federal changes, which we exclude from our primary sample of treatments because the change in missing number of jobs, Δb , is only identified from time-series variation for these events as there are no "control states" with wage floors lower than the new minimum wage (see the text for details).

Minimum Wage Has Gone from Highly Binding to Irrelevant to Binding



FIGURE 2. SHARE OF HOURS AT OR BELOW THE MINIMUM WAGE

Notes: The figure plots estimates of the share of hours worked for reported wages equal to or less than the applicable state or federal minimum wage, corresponding with data from columns 4 and 8 of Tables 1A and 1B.

Autor, Manning & Smith 2017

Agenda

1 Incomes: Levels, Growth, Inequality Household incomes

Wage Inequality Intergenerational income mobility

2 Skills, Education, and Earnings Skills and educational attainment Wage differentials by skill Occupational change & employment polarization

- **3** Top Incomes and Superstars
- 4 Trade and Labor Markets
- **5** The Importance of Place
- 6 Minimum wages, Pay comparisons, Wage spillovers
- 7 Gender Differences in Education and Labor Markets

Percentage of 25-34 Year-Olds Who Have Attained Tertiary Education, by Gender (2014)



1. Brazil, Chile, France, Korea, Russian Federation, Saudi Arabia: Year of reference 2013.

2. Indonesia: Year of reference 2011.

3. South Africa: Year of reference 2012.

Countries are ranked in descending order of the percentage of women who attained tertiary education.

Years of Completed Schooling by Birth Cohort and Sex, 1876 - 1975



Figure 1.5. Years of Schooling by Birth Cohorts, U.S. Native-Born, by Sex: 1876 to 1975. This figure plots the mean years of completed schooling for U.S. native-born residents by birth cohort and sex, adjusted to age 35 using the approach described in the notes to Figure 1.4. Sources: 1940 to 2000 IPUMS.

U.S. Women are Better Students than U.S. Men



Murphy and Topel 2016

Educational Attainment by High School Graduates: Cohorts Completing High School 1916 – 2003



Murphy and Topel 2016

U.S. Wen's College Attainment: Not Much Happening



Murphy and Topel 2016

U.S. Women's College Attainment: Big Gains



Murphy and Topel 2016

Failure to Launch: BA Attainment for Students Enrolling in a 4-Year College in 2003/04 by Family Income Quartile



National Center for Education Statistics, Beginning Postsecondary Students Longitudinal Study

14.662 requirements

Requirements

- 1 Weekly readings/comments
- 2 Four p-sets
- 3 Two research proposals
- 4 Final/general
- **6** Class participation